

AGENDA

Climate Action Working Group

Marin Conservation League, Tamalpais Room

175 North Redwood Drive, Suite 135, San Rafael

Friday, August 21, 2015 9:00 AM

- 1. Introductions**
- 2. Approval of agenda**
- 3. Approval of minutes** (April and July)
- 4. 9:10 Discussion:** moving climate action planning forward in Marin. To prepare it would help to familiarize yourself with the updated Marin County Climate Action Plan, (www.marincounty.org/climate). Our goal will be to formulate a comprehensive and focused CAWG action plan for this fall. Suggestions include encouraging the County and cities to work climate change planning, sea level rise, etc., into all levels of planning and all documents where climate issues are relevant; facilitating the switch from carbon to clean energy by supporting MCE and CCA efforts in other parts of California before the CPUC and State Legislature; initiating and supporting events and programs to reach broader parts of our population. Also, bring any questions you have.
- 5. 10:10 Reports**
 - a. Resilient Neighborhoods – Tamra
 - b. Main Street Moms, Sept 22nd training at MCE – Mary
 - c. Sustainables, November 5th event – Bill and Belle
 - d. Community Marin – Rick
 - e. Issues before the CPUC and Legislature – Pat
 - f. Other Reports
- 6. Announcements**
- 7. Adjourn**

DRAFT

MARIN CONSERVATION LEAGUE
Climate Action Working Group: April 17, 2015
Muir Woods Conference Room, 175 N. Redwood Blvd., San Rafael

Present: Co-chairs Pam Reaves and Doug Wilson; also, Bob Bundy, Nona Dennis, Tom Flynn, Heather Furmidge, Kiki LaPorta, Mary Morgan, Pat Nelson, Kate Powers, Roger Roberts, Judy Teichman

Guest Speakers: Dana Armanino, Sustainability Planner and Energy Specialist, Marin County; Jane Elias, Energy and Sustainability Community Programs Coordinator, Sonoma County; and Alice Stover, Energy Efficiency Program Specialist, Marin Clean Energy

Doug opened the meeting at 9:04.

Quick Intros: Attendee intros.

Approval of Minutes: Minutes from March 20, 2015 meeting approved.

Approval of the Agenda: Agenda approved.

Discussion with Jane Elias, Energy and Sustainability Community Programs Coordinator, Sonoma County; Dana Armanino, Sustainability Planner and Energy Specialist with Marin County; and Alice Stover, Energy Efficiency Specialist, Marin Clean Energy

Dana described the energy efficiency programs available through the County. Marin County has two major programs: Marin County Energy Watch Partnership (MCEW), a joint project with PG&E, and Bay Area Regional Energy Network (BayREN). BayREN funds a Home Upgrade Advisor, a source of info to all the programs available by calling one phone number. Dana mentioned the Property Assessed Clean Energy (PACE) financing program available for residential and commercial properties. Marin has modeled its participation agreements and best management practices standards after Sonoma County's.

Jane Elias described the programs available through Sonoma's Energy and Sustainability division including their Energy Watch Program. This summer Sonoma is adding a Rising Sun program through the Community Youth Energy Services workforce development program for residences.

Ann Hancock, and the Center for Climate Protection (formerly Climate Protection Campaign), a nonprofit, started the momentum in Sonoma County. Their work in 2004-05 started the community climate action plan that is how the Energy and Sustainability division came into being.

Sonoma's Energy Independence Program is the longest running PACE financing program in the nation and the first multi-jurisdictional based program. PACE is self-funded through the Sonoma County Treasury. Also Sonoma started a PACE financing marketplace open to other PACE operators through a collaborative services agreement. Sonoma's Energy Independence office conducts marketing and outreach by disseminating info and being a one-stop shop for information.

In addition, Sonoma has a Green Business Program and contractor programs with a tool lending library--open to all contractors. (Marin also has a tool lending library through the Marin Builders Association.)

Regional Climate Protection Authority helps cities in Sonoma create their climate action plans.

Sonoma Clean Power is Sonoma's community choice aggregation program.

Pay As You Save is a water conservation on-bill repayment program. Water conservation upgrades are paid back over time through water bills. To make it work, it has to be cost neutral. Savings have to equate to what will have to be paid over a five or ten year period. In order for that program to work, billing has to be billed on a gallon basis instead of a CCF basis. In Marin, there would have to be an overhaul of the billing system and possibly the metering system. Roger suggested that Dana do a public presentation to the Water Boards. He said some of the Boardmembers are sympathetic and that that is one of the recommendations that was made to the Board by the Water Advisory Committee two years ago.

Alice spoke about MCE's programs. MCE uses PG&E data and contacts high energy users and directs them to their website's "My Energy Tool". There are obstacles with the website but MCE is working to improve it. CPUC funds available for website improvements, (generally education, marketing, outreach), are very limited. Beckie Menten of MCE is exploring Community Development Block Grants for energy efficiency programs.

Discuss collaboration among community groups and Marin Clean Energy to reach targeted segments of energy users.

Marin County has four staff people doing outreach and has helped fund Resilient Neighborhoods for outreach through the Energy Watch Partnership. Sonoma has a staff of eight doing outreach along with three interns. Sonoma is starting homeowner workshops where a homeowner who has done improvements will champion them. They have a similar program with commercial buildings. MCE has a staff of three on energy efficiency. Mary asked if there is value in training citizen ambassadors to augment outreach. Dana said there would need to be development of a training module. Alice said she is interested in learning from the local Deep Green outreach efforts and how to harness that for energy efficiency. Mary said it would be valuable in pooling the info about the barriers of why people don't sign up for Deep Green. She said part of the reason for people not changing their behavior is they don't have information. Alice pointed out the challenge for energy efficiency is how complex it can get.

Kiki said the Sustainables are having a retreat at the end of May to designate their priority actions and she asked Alice for info on how they might help. Doug asked why a lot of the cities are not on Deep Green. Dana answered the County chose to go Light Green because their energy use is so high and they decided to counter that by installing solar panels onsite. Kiki said public testimony at City Council meetings can be useful not only in educating Councilmembers but also the public because many people still don't know they're MCE customers or the difference between the two programs -Light Green vs. Deep Green. Dana said that they are developing a talking sheet for realtors and new homeowner kits with info.

Doug expressed concern that outreach efforts only reach those already motivated to make changes. He asked how to reach deeper into society. Dana said she usually hears from those hit financially. Kiki said there is an entire discipline now on communicating about climate change in ways to initiate the behavior change required. Jane said that water issues will help drive behavior

change with water conservation first and maybe from there through the water energy nexus. Kiki said that water is tangible, energy less so; that energy efficiency is abstract. Water districts are strapped because of their commodity pricing. When people use less water, the districts make less money.

The Cities and Counties are streamlining and expediting permits for solar now and there are caps on allowable permit fees of \$500. Nona asked if there is distinction in permit standards between ground-based solar and roof-based solar. Sonoma solar ordinance permits up to 125% of existing usage because there is some concern there may be a blight and there are open space concerns. One of the criteria for permits looks at whether it will be exporting energy offsite.

Pam asked whether multi-family units that change from a single meter to individual meters would qualify for funding by any programs. Jane replied that PACE may apply, if there is an upgrade.

Brief updates, reports, announcements:

Kiki described a multi-family affordable housing project she is working on retrofitting for energy efficiency to zero net energy. In this unit, they want to change from individual meters to a single meter so they can obtain a subsidy for net energy metering with solar but apply a Lucid dashboard (a current tracker that gathers data of energy flow to an apartment) to monitor each residence's use. It gives info to each residence to feed behavior change.

Tom Flynn is organizing leaders of Marin's and Sonoma's dairy sector (about 80 dairies) eg. Clover Stornetta, Straus, Organic Valley, also Petaluma Creamery, Wallabee Yogurt. He and Judy have organized a presentation at Giacomini's Point Reyes Bleu Cheese facility to view methane digester and enjoy cheese tasting. The event will be June 20th. Tom will talk about this energy alliance and how to get a customer initially engaged. It's hard to get up to speed with filling out paperwork and doing research. But if you have peer leaders of a group who are energy efficient and have a methane digester, it helps to organize to receive group discounts and to do ag management energy plans.

Tom is also working with Families for Clean Air in San Geronimo Valley to convert wood burning stoves to cleaner burning appliances. Electric heat pumps are being considered to move away from propane and replace with renewable electricity source.

Doug mentioned MCE's protesting of PG&E's proposal for installing and owning infrastructure and recharging stations for electric vehicles across the state. MCE filed a joint motion with the Center for Sustainable Energy and the Green Power Institute, among other organizations, to amend the scope of the rule making. MCE requested consideration of a list of issues that were not well thought out in the \$1 billion infrastructure proposal. Also MCE filed a protest letter to PG&E's letter on its implementation of EV rebates to prevent interruption of MCE's revenue stream .

Action: Doug will compose a letter to CPUC supporting MCE's position that EV recharge infrastructure build-out be a competitive process and he will copy CAWG members.

MCCMC's next meeting is Wednesday, 4/22 at 6:00 p.m., in Tiburon. It would be a good opportunity to ask Mayors why their town is not participating in MCE's Deep Green.

MCL's upcoming Business Breakfast will feature State Senator Mike McGuire on Friday, 5/15, at 7:30 a.m.

Thursday, April 23, is the San Rafael Climate Change Action Plan meeting at the City Council's upstairs conference room.

MCL's Annual Meeting, April 24, is sold out.

Environmental Forum's last Lecture this year is on Wednesday, April 22, 7:00 – 9:00 titled "Building Community: Strengthening Marin on Earth Day".

Upcoming C-SMART meetings will be held at the Dance Palace on May 30 and in Stinson Beach on June 6.

Nona reported on the subset of Community Marin who are seeking a coordinated approach to sea level rise. Marge Macris is meeting with MCCMC's sea level rise subcommittee. The County allocated \$250,000 to do a vulnerability study. Part of that will act as matching funds as the County applies for grants, and part will be used to plan a coordinated effort studying vulnerability.

The County's Climate Action Plan's final version should be out in May. Dana said the comments were awesome and the next version will be so much better. It will probably go before the Board of Supervisors in July.

Marin Climate and Energy Partnership just launched the Marin Tracker. marintracker.org It tracks how each City and the County are doing on climate action efforts. It looks at energy, water, waste, and transportation. It's a visual representation of data. Hopefully it will spark some competition between the jurisdictions.

Nona proposed that the next Business Breakfast be focused on some issue within the framework of the Climate Action committee.

Bob Bundy suggested that the group invite MMWD to talk about water conservation and energy use at a future meeting.

Next Meeting: May 15, 10:00 a.m.–12:00 p.m.

Meeting adjourned 11:12 a.m.

Notes: KP

MARIN CONSERVATION LEAGUE

Climate Action Working Group: July 17, 2015

draft draft draft

Tamalpais Conference Room, 175 N. Redwood Blvd., San Rafael

Present: Co-chairs Pam Reaves and Doug Wilson; also, Kate Powers, Oksana Scherba, Tom Flynn, Belle Cole (Organizing for Action Marin), Bob Spofford, Rick Fraithe, Judy Teichman, Taylor Watts, Ed Mainland, Susan Robinson, Pat Nelson. Also present as guest speakers: Michael Callahan-Dudley, MCE Regulatory Counsel; Cory Bytof, City of San Rafael Sustainability Coordinator; Allison Hang, MCE; Damon Connolly, Marin Supervisor.

Doug called the meeting to order and circulated a signup sheet at 9:03.

1. **Quick Intros:** Attendee introductions.
2. **Approval of the Agenda:** The agenda was approved with the addition of an informational item re MCL procedures. M/S, Susan/Rick.
3. **Approval of Minutes:** Minutes from the June 26, 2015 meeting were approved with corrections.
4. **Discussion Items**
 - a. **MCL Procedures**

Doug stated that the proper procedure is to send items to be distributed to Pam and Doug. We will be reviewing letter-writing. Pam is compiling a history of our letters. This will be available on the website.

- b. **Allison Hang, MCE: Follow-up on discussion in June meeting re training to inform community members**

Allison reported on the progress in developing a training program for community advocates, as suggested by Main Street Moms. Allison and MCE have compiled a draft outline of training, with the assistance of the Moms. The training will educate advocates on technical issues and address issues of practice (starting conversations with community members). Participants will brainstorm on the role of CCA/MCE, resources grid and power procurement, general procurement principles and policies, understanding the electricity bill, and starting the conversation/elevator pitches. Allison presented a draft outline including the subtopics for each of these discussion items. She stated that there will be a meeting on July 31 at 1125 Tamalpais Ave., the new MCE office.

Allison also discussed the composition of the audience for newly trained community advocates. These include the new MCE communities and existing customers. Outreach is needed because only two percent of customers are deep green customers.

c. Michael Callahan-Dudley, Regulatory Counsel for MCE: Issues before the the California Public Utilities Commission which impact the climate and MCE

Michael presented information about monitoring the CPUC, how the CPUC affects MCE, and how MCL might be able to help on climate issues. He also provided background information on CPUC procedures.

One way in which MCL might help is to allow MCE to incorporate community feedback in its CPUC advocacy. Key areas of advocacy include energy efficiency, compliance with Renewable Portfolio Standards, and rates.

Energy-Efficiency Programs: Legal Background and Agency Interfaces

Legislation

Public Utility Code 381.1 allocates energy-efficiency funding

- Collects funds directly from MCE ratepayers
- Draws from a pool of funds (public purpose statewide)

Agencies

California Energy Commission

- Prepares energy demand forecasts (10-year forecasts)
- Part of this process is to look an amount of energy-efficiency component

CPUC

- Creates goals from CEC forecast
- Allocates public-purpose fund

MCE

- One of three CCAs in California
- Only one doing energy-efficiency via CPUC (from public purpose funds)

Q. Has MCE been shortchanged on the amount of public-purpose funds it receives?

A. The budget pales in comparison with the amount received by investor-owned utilities (IOUs). IOUs can focus on easy to reach EE options. The restrictions on working around IOUs have been lifted. CCA can now go after any customer in its service territory with programs that serve those sectors. The most recent amount was \$1-2 mil/yr. Will ask for \$10 mil/yr.

MCE Plan

The business plan for 2016 and beyond is to go sector by sector. The goal is to get MCE EE plans before the CPUC before PG&E gets theirs before the CPUC. MCE is interested in integrating a whole suite of resources that the customer may be interested in.

- Opportunity for Public Comment on Implementation Plans
<http://www.mcecleanenergy.org/energy-savings/>
- Technical Committee Meeting Aug. 3, 5pm – 7pm@MCE
- Executive Commit Meeting Aug. 5, 10am – 12pm@MCE

LIFT (Low-Income Families and Tenants) pilot program

MCE Energy-Efficiency program that offers more incentives for income-qualified customers. The goal is to serve “hidden communities” not adequately served by existing EE programs. The program matches EE savings 2 to 1, puts savings in an account. The income-qualification threshold is 200% of the federal poverty level.

The IOUs also do energy-efficiency programs; PG&E partners with local governments, for example, in the Marin Energy Watch program. IOUs are sometimes aligned with MCE on goals for moving the CPUC.

Michael passed out a chart outlining procedures at the CPUC. The CPUC considers specific applications by utilities (for example, to build electric charging stations) and also conducts rulemaking proceedings. Parties to a proceeding have opportunities to protest and respond to CPUC actions and to submit comments, testimony and legal briefing. Proceedings have several phases designed to develop a record and basis for decisionmaking: policy, fact-finding, legal argument, proposed decision, final decision, and implementation.

Source of CPUC authority: The state constitution. CPUC is located in San Francisco to keep maintain separation from the legislature. CPUC has two offices and 900 employees. Sixty percent of its work concerns energy. Five commissioners vote on decisions, the vote sometimes entail an alternate decision. When a decision is adopted, it is essentially law.

Energy Efficiency at the CPUC

- Energy-Efficiency Proceeding
Phase II – Process
Phase III – Policy. Phase III offers an opportunity for MCL involvement. Policy questions addressed include statewide v. local, fuel-switching, dealing with data.
- Energy Savings Assistance Program and California Alternate Rates for Energy (CARE) Proceeding. These assist low-income customers.
- Integrated Demand-Side Proceeding. These break down silos, provide and integrated suite with incentives/policies.
- Distribution Resources Plan Proceeding. These concern the distribution system. The IOUs propose management plans, and energy efficiency is one way to free up capacity.

What Can MCL Do?

Strategic Interventions: Participate in workshops, public meetings; write letters of support (attached to MCE submissions or sent directly to decisionmakers); participate in ex parte meetings with decisionmakers (these interactions must be reported in writing to the

commission and other parties); intervene as a party in a proceeding (examples of frequent intervenors: NRDC, TURN); help to build the record (identify relevant reports, comment at workshops, compile reports); act as ambassadors for MCE in the community.

Comment on ex parte communication reporting requirement: Must report communication to the “service list” of parties to the proceeding; the only time one cannot communicate with decisionmakers is when the proceeding is in a “quiet phase” (rare). There is no ex parte reporting requirement for quasi-legislative proceedings.

d. MCE Draft Energy-Efficiency Program Implementation Plan

MCL will take action on this item:

MCL response to draft plan: Establish a subcommittee for the purpose of commenting. Time frame of next Wednesday for comment is unrealistic, but they are accepting verbal comment up August 3 at the next MCE board meeting.

Tom Flynn volunteered to work on this. Ed Mainland will serve as scribe. Doug is MCL honcho.

We don't have to start from scratch; we can draw on work already done.

Timeframe: Present comments at one of the upcoming MCE meetings. It might not be possible to get MCL board to approve by Wednesday. Maybe by Friday, or before the pertinent MCE meetings.

e. Report of Supervisor Damon Connolly and SR Sustainability Coordinator Cory Bytof on Stakeholders Working Together on Climate Change Mitigation Issues

Follow-up report on Sup. Connolly's initiative on best methods to get County, cities, staff and citizens to work together on climate change mitigation. Primary question is how to structure the endeavor.

Damon Connolly

This is a substantial initiative, a continuation of brainstorming. The County has a draft Climate Change Action Plan. An update may occur by Fall. One issue is who should be at the table for the update. Although the Plan technically applies only to the unincorporated areas of the County, the cities should be there, as well as county subcommittees, dedicated staff, community groups. The cities are at various stages, with San Rafael serving as a model. There is substantial precedent for County staff assisting/working with the cities.

The initiative would provide regular meetings, prioritization, and tracking of progress. First step: Form a working group to get started? There is currently a committee dedicated to sea level rise. This is separate. Damon and Kate Sears are spearheading. Work with the councils and mayors.

Issues teed up:

- Scope of initiative: Should not be too broad – example, Green Building Initiative
- Coordinate with existing groups
- Interface with the public. MCL is a start
- How can the County become a leader?

Cory Bytof

San Rafael will present a plan next Thursday. Focus is on implementation. Reliance on County staff is useful. Models include the Los Angeles Climate Collaborative under the auspices of UCLA. There will possibly be quarterly meetings with all stakeholders. Fit the culture of the county. This is an iterative process. It will not necessarily bring all parties together at the same time.

Comment: The San Rafael Plan is a high-level plan with hooks for implementation (specific actions). Bob Brown was a moving force.

Question: What is the best way to involve cities that are lagging?

Suggested Answers: Peer pressure. Example of the Marin Climate Energy Partnership (process/plan). Bring resources and offer support. Develop a working plan for Corte Madera; Sausalito is catching up. Invite the lagging cities in after progress is well under way. Progress is due to citizens coming before the dais; council members pay attention. Possibly a guest speaker, such as Stephanie Moulton Peters.

Question: What are the problems specific to unincorporated Marin?

Answer: The distinction is artificial, based on jurisdiction. As long as there is a specific program, cities and county can work together. There are more difficult jurisdictional issues if policies are involved. Inter-jurisdictional cooperation is required. The PACE program is an example of a non silo approach. Dana Armanino of County staff put together a packet that cities can adapt. This involved extensive work that the cities don't have to duplicate. MCE is also a partner of the County.

Question: What is MCL's first step to facilitate?

Answer: Factors:

- Don't wait until the plan is finalized.
- Define goal and implementation plan. AB 32 targets; push for interim targets. Targets at the top of every agenda.
- Form a working group?

Question: Should a subcommittee be formalized soon?

Answer: Yes.

Question: What about funding?

Answer: Will work this out. Are there climate-ready grants? No, these are specific to vulnerability assessments.

Further Comments: Work out the timeline for finalizing subcommittee staffing; at community meeting?

Dana Armanino has set up meetings re cap. These are not translating into specific implementation steps.

MCL homework: Who is on the work group? When would it start? How to get public support? Start submitting names.

Damon will work on the administrative plan. The best ideas come from public participation. There is buy-in if they are part of the process from the ground up.

5. Reports and Announcements

Report of Cory Bytof on MCE developments at the CPUC

CPUC made the decision to change the rate structure, taking away the A-6 Rate Tariff. The removal means a loss of demand-charge reductions. There is no incentive for solar; there is a huge disincentive. Customers will pay at least as much if they switch to solar. This decision is now in the implementation phase. Cory will send his letter of protest. An MCL letter is possible re implementation.

Question: Who is pushing this change.

Answer: The IOUs. Commissioner Picker. Picker's confirmation is in August; try to block it. Look up who is on the Senate Rules Committee and lobby them. It takes homework to make the case.

Report of Rick Fraites, Community Marin: Rick met with Supervisors Connolly and Arnold and plans to meet with the other Supes re sea-level rise and adaptation.

Report of Judy Teichman: The MCE Implementation Plan does not include any reference to our June 9th letter re funding for agricultural programs. They are inviting comment. Should we comment? Answer: There is no time to produce a new letter.

Report of Belle Cole, Organizing for Action – Marin: Organizing for Action and Sustainable San Rafael and other organizations are sponsoring a Forum at Dominican University on Amping Up Climate Leadership. Jared Huffman is working with them. They will be looking at the U.N. Conference in Paris in December. Gov. Brown will be attending the U.N. Conference, addressing the topic: Can the California Climate Model Inspire Global Action. Ken Alex and Kevin de Leon were figures in constructing the California model.

The Forum at Dominican will take place on November 5th. Topics and speakers include: How to Make Climate a Presidential Issue in 2016, Tom Steyer; What Is Possible in Congress, Jared Huffman; Can People Power Free Us from Fossil Fuels, Bill McKibben. Mary Marcy, President of Dominican, will preside. Ed suggested Diane Moss of 100% Renewables.

Announcements:

The Ag Land Committee will address carbon farming plans at their August 28 meeting.

Cory: There will be a report on the 2012-1013 GHG plan on 8/3.

There will be an art exhibit re climate adaptation in the Jan. – Feb. ArtWorks event in downtown San Rafael.

There will be a Soil, Not Oil conference on 9/4 – 9/5 in Richmond.

The Urban Land Institute has issued a report entitled “Tackling Sea Level Rise: Best Practices in the Bay Area.”

Sustainable San Rafael will have a 10-year anniversary party at Whipper Snapper from 3:00 – 5:00 on 8/9.

There will be a meeting on the San Rafael Quarterly Climate Action Plan Implementation on 7/23 from 7:00 – 9:00 at SR City Hall, 2nd Floor.

Meeting Adjourned 11:22.

Notes: PN