

MARIN CONSERVATION LEAGUE
Climate Action Working Group
San Rafael Corporate Center, 750 Lindero
Tamalpais Conference Room
February 20, 2015
9:00 a.m.-11:00 p.m.

AGENDA

QUICK INTROS

APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA

PROGRAM: 9:10- 11:45

Guest Speaker Introductions:

Debbie Raphael, Director of San Francisco Department of the Environment
Allison Quaid, Energy Efficiency Specialist, SF Department of the Environment
Jack Liebster, Marin County Planning Manager, Future Planning

Debbie Raphael will briefly (3-5 minutes each) respond to the following questions:

- 1) What is San Francisco doing to reach its Energy Efficiency (EE) goals? How are programs funded and who administers them? Are there changes that could be made at the CPUC which would make EE programs more effective?
- 2) 2) How can we work across agency boundaries to tackle issues like sea level rise and other climate related vulnerabilities?

Jack Liebster will briefly (3-5 minutes each) respond to the following questions:

- 1) Current progress County wide
- 2) Challenges we face for jurisdictions to work together to achieve coherent collaborative progress
- 3) Steps the community can take to help achieve progress
- 4) Stakeholders, missing stakeholders
- 5) County run energy efficiency programs in place. Who is in charge of these and how are they funded

These brief responses (to very large questions) will open up the conversation for the speakers and the entire group for the bulk of our time together.

APPROVAL OF JANUARY 9 MINUTES: (refer to pdf attachment)

ACTION ITEM:

NEXT MEETING: Friday, March 20, 2015 LOCATION TO BE DETERMINED

ANNOUNCEMENTS:

ADJOURN

Draft

**MARIN CONSERVATION LEAGUE
Climate Action Working Group: January 9, 2015
San Rafael Corporate Center, Boro Conference Room**

Present: Co-chairs Pam Reaves and Doug Wilson; also Tom Flynn, Pat Nelson, Bill Carney, Kate Powers, Rick Fraites, Bob Spofford, Jana Haehl, Heather Furmidge, Nona Dennis, Bill Carney, Ed Mainland. Becky Menten of MCE joined the group for a portion of the meeting.

Doug opened the meeting at 9:00.

Quick Intros: Attendee introductions.

Approval of the Agenda: Agenda was approved. Later, the order of reports was changed: "c. San Rafael and BCDC" report was moved up to accommodate attendees who had to leave early.

Approval of December 5, 2014 Minutes: Minutes Approved.

Reports:

a) Community Marin (Nona Dennis)

The Community Marin document, written originally in 1991 in advance of the 1994 Countywide Plan, was updated in 1998, 2003, and 2013. A variety of Marin environmental groups have contributed to the document over the years. However, recently Community Marin contributor Marin Sierra Club objected to the 2013 update being used as a policy document for advocacy in the political arena.

In order to forward Community Marin's recommendations focused solely on sea level rise, Community Marin Action Committee (CMAC) was formed and has been meeting for the past year as an independent group. Priscilla Bull has been chairing CMAC. Marge Macris has been keeping it going. Rick Freitas, Ann Thomas, Don Dickenson, Randy Greenberg, Susan Stompe, Nona, Barbara Salzman are members. The group's goal is to encourage Marin jurisdictions and groups to create leadership and countywide coordination of a plan of action on adaptation to sea level rise.

To that end, members of CMAC have met with Cory Bytof of Marin Climate and Energy Partnership; Supervisors Katie Rice, Judy Arnold, Steve Kinsey, and Kate Sears; Marin County Planning's Brian Crawford and Jack Liebster; Paul Jensen, Director of Community Development, San Rafael; Sandeep Karkal, the GM of Novato Sanitary District; and have talked with Southern Marin Sewer Agency. Marge Macris has met with a subgroup of the Marin County Council of Mayors and Councilmembers including Claire McAuliffe (Belvedere), Kate Colin (SR), Stephanie Moulton-Peters (Mill Valley), Ray Withy (Sausalito), and Kevin Haroff (Larkspur).

CMAC has been following the County's Climate Action Plan which added a section on adaptation. The Board of Supervisors established adaptation to sea level rise as one of their top priorities for 2015.

Next steps: Marin Community Foundation hired Bruce Riordan, a climate strategist working with ABAG and MTC, to find out who's doing what in Marin. Nona, and others, have been phone interviewed by Bruce.

CMAC is writing an op-ed for the Independent Journal. In summary it says there are lots of things going on around the topic of adaptation to sea level rise but that the County needs to have a coordinated plan and that all the jurisdictions need to be involved.

<http://www.marinij.com/general-news/20150118/marin-voice-marin-needs-a-plan-to-adapt-to-sea-level-rise>

Nona suggested that as long as CMAC is moving forward that MCL, in particular CAWG, not duplicate but support and stay apprised of CMAC's work and supplement as necessary.

Doug – CMAC has great deal of expertise and is focusing on policymakers. They are not primarily community organizers. A problem for CMAC is that it has some tenuous connections with some of the Community Marin groups.

Pam - CAWG would like to continue to be updated with CMAC's efforts so that CAWG's efforts line up.

Tom – While CMAC's focus is on adaptation, CAWG could be focusing on mitigation and opportunities for Marin setting an example in terms of climate change impacts.

Bill – Asked that the other groups represented (Main Street Moms, Sustainable SR, etc.) at the CAWG meeting, also be alerted when those organizations can be mobilized to amplify CMAC's efforts. Bill is concerned that assessment and adaptation, and particularly the expenditure of the County's \$250,000, not be limited to sea level rise but rather the whole suite of climate vulnerability impacts.

Nona and Rick will take points raised back to CMAC.

b) San Rafael and BCDC – (Pam, Doug, Bill Carney)

The City of San Rafael is working with BCDC to update their Local Hazard Mitigation Plan and it will include a Climate Overlay. The City of San Rafael has hired a new Emergency Operations Manager, John Bruckbauer, who will work with BCDC and ABAG on the plan. The updated LHMP will position San Rafael to receive grants for planning and implementation. SR's plan will be modeled after Berkeley's LHMP update which had broad community support.

<http://www.ci.berkeley.ca.us/Mitigation/>

This came about after FEMA rolled out new flood maps a little over a year ago highlighting cities' need for Local Hazard Mitigation Plans in order for its residents to qualify for flood insurance. Around the same time, Paul Jensen prepared San Rafael's white paper "Climate Adaptation – Sea Level Rise" **http://www.ca-ilg.org/sites/main/files/file-attachments/sea_level-issues-paper-city-of-san-rafael.pdf**

Then Priority Development Area funding allowed SR to get money to do a study with BCDC of sea level rise in the downtown San Rafael PDA. Cory Bytof coordinated the various elements. Cory also has been supporting Resilient Neighborhoods' outreach as it brings together adaptation and mitigation, particularly through hazard preparedness.

The County has written a grant proposal to match the \$250,000 they have set aside for adaptation. BCDC had indicated that would be needed for a county-wide vulnerability assessment.

c) Sustainable groups (Bill Carney)

Sustainable San Rafael's focus has been on Housing Elements both in SR and the County. SR recently adopted their housing element, as has Novato and the County. The State is trying to create a nexus between housing development and transportation planning. The State responded to San Rafael that they would like to see beefed up language about energy efficiency and green building standards. It might be good for CAWG to look at what the local Housing Elements are actually saying about energy efficiency programs.

There is a focus on equity as well as environment and economy.

San Rafael's Climate Change Action Committee's quarterly meeting is coming up that may focus on SR's Local Hazard Mitigation Plan and funding. SR's budget planning is coming up.

Bill would like MCL to weigh in on the County's Vulnerability Assessment in a timely way.

Discussion

Energy Efficiency Subgroup (Ed Mainland, Bob Spofford, Tom Flynn)

The subgroup is taking a look at what MCL might offer in terms of advocacy support of energy efficiency measures in Marin. CA's major energy efficiency targets are a component of the State's greenhouse gas reduction program. One of Governor Brown's new goals in his inaugural speech for 2030, which reaches beyond 2020 goals, is to double the efficiency of existing buildings and make heating fuel cleaner. That's on top of existing state goals of net-zero new buildings.

The state and all communities have their work cut out for them and only by really deep energy efficiency can we meet those goals. The vision of a new energy paradigm is the idea that we can't consume, produce, and use energy the way we have been.

The mandate of the subgroup is to come up with a short list of actionable, feasible measures that MCL can support at the local level to materially move EE forward. And secondly, to propose to MCL an assessment of MCE's 2016 energy efficiency program, so MCL weighs in.

The subgroup generated a list of criteria for an ideal energy efficiency program to stimulate discussion. The list was emailed to CAWG subcommittee members.

Also distributed was a list from Becky Menten (MCE) of the fundamental obstacles that MCE's EE program is facing.

Becky – MCE is currently encouraging feedback on the 2016 program structure they are envisioning as a single platform to access their energy efficiency programs. MCE's 2016 EE program draft is at <http://www.mcecleanenergy.org/wp-content/uploads/Draft2016EEDesigns.pdf>

Bill – Groups like Sustainable San Rafael would benefit from CAWG EE's subgroup guidance on what comments should be to support drafting their own letters to MCE's 2016 Energy Efficiency Program.

Also MCE has an energy efficiency listserve for those who would like to stay informed on future EE presentations and updates. To sign up, <http://www.marincleanenergy.org/ee>

CAWG's subgroup is currently discussing whether it thinks energy efficiency fits within MCE's business model because the economics of energy efficiency are currently a big problem. The subgroup is also discussing EE ideas about programs that are separate from the incumbent utilities and effective ways to incentivize people to be more efficient.

Tom -- There are programs in the Bay Area that are working and that are cost effective. There are jurisdictional EE required standards and there are incentives.

All jurisdictions have to abide by the State's updated Building Energy Efficiency Program, Title 24. Title 24 currently applies to new construction, but there is potential for folding in existing buildings with triggers, such as time of sale or rental, for efficiency standards being implemented, possibly with some funding.

The heart of action at the state level is at the CA Energy Commission's Energy Efficiency office. How can CAWG and MCL support them?

Action item: Ed will send contacts at CEC's Energy Efficiency office to Pam.

San Rafael's "green-building" ordinance Marin Green Building Energy Retrofit and Solar Transformation (BERST) required property owners embarking on new construction or renovation projects to incorporate ways to make their buildings more energy efficient into their plans. Residential resale and remodels are large energy opportunities. But ordinance became bureaucratically hard to enforce. CAWG may want to explore BERST, what worked, and what the problems were.

The meaning and connotation differences between "efficiency" and "conservation" were discussed.

The EE subgroup may start preparation for a presentation to the MCL Board.

Announcements:

Marin County Mayors and Councilmembers meet in San Anselmo on January 28, at 6:00 to socialize. It's a good time to lobby for funding from each town for climate action plans. 7:00 is dinner and a meeting.

C-SMART updates as well as other updates are available through the Marin County website. Register email address and check the topics you are interested in.

<https://public.govdelivery.com/accounts/CAMARIN/subscriber/new?pop=t>

Next Meeting: February 20, 9:00–11:00 a.m., at San Rafael Corporate Center Conference Room

Debbie Raphael, Director of San Francisco Department of the Environment, her energy efficiency specialist, Allison Quaid, and Jack Liebster, Marin County Planning Manager, will be guests

Meeting adjourned 11:09 a.m.

Notes: KP